

Sufficiency and usefulness of digital and printed materials: their implications to teaching and learning 21st century literature

Jovelyn R. Azuelo

PHINMA University of Iloilo

Iloilo City, Philippines

Email: iamjrazuelo@gmail.com

Abstract: This qualitative-phenomenological study was conducted to find out the sufficiency and usefulness of digital and printed materials and their implications to teaching and learning 21st Century Literature. The study was conducted to five Senior High School teachers and ten (10) learners of PHINMA University of Iloilo. Findings showed that the English teachers viewed digital materials as supplements to printed materials, a convenient way of accessing information and a great challenge; while learners viewed them as easier learning material and a newer way to learn concepts. Teachers viewed printed materials as helpful and useful learning materials and reliable and effective learning resources while learners viewed them as convenient materials and accessible to all learners. Both teachers and learners found digital and printed materials sufficient and useful. Implications of digital and printed materials into teaching and learning 21st Century Literature were formulated on the basis of result of this study.

Keywords: Sufficiency, Usefulness, Digital and Printed Materials, 21st Century Literature

Date Submitted: September 22, 2024

Date Accepted: October 21, 2024

Date Published: January 9, 2024

INTRODUCTION

Instructional materials play a vital role in order for the teaching and learning process to become more effective. As mentioned by Bukoye (2019), instructional materials are helping tools for teachers and enable learners to develop their macro-skills, including the use of media and technology. They enable learners to enhance their memory level by illustrating things which learners easily forget, give lessons a personal look, and develop creativity of teachers.

In view of the foregoing benefits, teachers use digital materials as supplements in their lessons. Tosh et al. (2020) said that the most commonly used digital materials used in classroom instruction include resources from Youtube and content-specific resources such as ReadWorks and Khan Academy. Google services such as Google Classroom, Sheets, Forms, Google Meet etc. are widely sought by teachers to continue meeting students virtually and to have classes online.

On the other hand, printed materials are as functional as digital materials. According to Raw (2010) as cited Bukoye (2019), the first instructional material is the textbook. It is the key to all learning activities and curricula and has withstood through the test of time.

The Department of Education recently released DepEd Order No. 34 series of 2022 to give schools options on how to implement and start this academic year. The following are mentioned: In-person classes, Blended Learning, and Full Distance Learning.

Presently, classes are slowly getting back to normal and many modalities have been created and actualized.

Having thought of these instructional materials and as teaching and learning are slowly shifting back to 5-day-in- person classes and as 21st century learners have different sets of needs and demands, teachers are challenged to access instructional materials which are appropriate, updated, sufficient, and useful.

As an educator, the researcher is challenged to conduct a study on the sufficiency and usefulness of printed and digital materials and their implications to teaching and learning 21st Century Literature.

Statement of the problem

The study was conducted to find out the sufficiency and usefulness of digital and printed materials used by Senior High School teachers and learners and their implications to teaching and learning 21st Century Literature at PHINMA

University of Iloilo Senior High School in Iloilo City.

Specifically, this study sought answers to the following questions:

- 1) How do Senior High School teachers and learners view digital and printed materials as used in teaching 21st Century Literature?
- 2) How sufficient are the digital and printed materials used by teachers and learners in teaching and learning 21st Century Literature?
- 3) How useful are the digital and printed materials used by teachers and learners in teaching and learning 21st Century Literature?
- 4) What are the implications of the digital and printed materials to teaching and learning the 21st Century Literature?

METHODOLOGY

Research design

This study used the qualitative design using phenomenological approach. As explained by Tassone (2017), phenomenology is an in-depth, methodical effort to comprehend the structures of first-person lived experience. Smith (2013) mentioned that Edmund Husserl, the principal founder of Phenomenology, describes it as the study of “phenomena” - a variety of experiences, including verbal activity as well as perception, thinking, memory, imagination, emotion, desire, and volition, as well as bodily awareness and embodied action.

Moreover, this study used this approach by identifying the sufficiency and usefulness of digital and printed materials as used by teachers and learners. To get the necessary data, the researcher requested the respondents to freely and meaningfully respond to the questions.

Locale of the study and respondents

The selection of the participants of the study was based on a strategy referred to as "purposeful selection". According to Palinkas et al. (2016), it is a sampling technique used by qualitative researchers to find participants who can offer comprehensive and in-depth information about the phenomenon being studied. The participants were the total population of Senior High School English teachers teaching 21st Century Literature and Grade 11 learners at PHINMA University of Iloilo. In order to preserve the respondents' confidentiality, the researcher assigned pseudonyms.

Research instruments

The researcher used an in-depth interview guide questions as research instrument in order to get comprehensive and in-depth information during the interview process.

The interview guide questions had two parts. Part I was their short profile. Part II contained the major questions related to the study, focusing only on the sufficiency and usefulness of digital and printed materials. Respondents were encouraged to freely and meaningfully respond to the questions presented.

Data analyses procedure

The data gathered for the study were transcribed, interpreted, and analyzed using thematic analysis. Braun and Clarke (2006 in Blanza, 2022) defined thematic analysis as “a qualitative analytic method for identifying, analyzing, and reporting patterns (themes) within the data. It minimally organizes and describes data set in rich detail.”

Therefore, the researcher followed the six-step thematic analysis as it is considered as the most influential and widely-accepted approach (Maguire & Delahunt, 2017). These steps include becoming familiar with the data, generating initial codes, searching for themes, reviewing themes, defining and naming themes, and producing the report.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Teachers' views of digital materials

According to Harjanto and Surmani (2019), many schools use information and communication technologies (ICT) to incorporate technology into the classroom. One approach to implement the finest teaching practices is through the use of platforms like Google Classroom.

One of the main foci of the study was to ascertain the teachers' views of using digital materials in teaching 21st Century Literature. The emergent themes generated are the following: (1) supplement to printed materials, (2) convenient way to accessing information, and (3) a great challenge.

Supplement to printed materials

An article published by Manila Standard (2021), stated that people nowadays have begun to live under the new normal and students' ways to learn have changed. Teachers have to think of alternatives to adopt to changes brought about by the pandemic. Thus, digital materials were used not to replace printed books but to expand the options available to reflect the shifting requirements and conditions of Filipino students.

Most of the participants believed that digital materials helped them discuss their lessons in 21st Century Literature, especially those literary works which are quite long and complicated.

Participant 4 mentioned that “materials in Google Classroom act as supplements to provide knowledge expansion.”

Participant 2 supported and said, “the materials in Google Classroom are supplemental and used only if students needed more guidance on the topic.”

Generally, all the participants were one in saying that they use digital materials to provide a more vivid explanations and presentations of stories and literary works which they cannot do during classes as it takes time because the teachers have four parallel classes in a 90- minute class time.

In support to this, an article written by Promalayalam (2022) mentioned that the use of technology and digital materials does not decrease the value of books but rather increases their importance.

Convenient way of accessing information

As technology emerges and that the Google Classroom has been widely used as a learning resource, information access has improved. With the use of devices and with stable internet connection, one can access all available information instantly – the search bar has made it even much easier to look for whatever concept one wants to understand.

This idea is attested by Participant 3 who said, “it is convenient since materials posted in Google Classroom can be organized and easy to locate.” She also mentioned that since PHINMA follows a 3Cs (Connect, Coach, and Check) posting rule in Google Classroom, it has become more organized and learners can track their activities easily.

Participants 4 and 5 also said that it is convenient and efficient since they can maximize instruction and may integrate modern technologies as part of the learning system.

Participant 2 added that “It becomes convenient since the materials posted in Google Classroom can help the students even without the face-to-face classes.”

In the study of Kvavik (n.d.), convenience was one of the perceived advantages of employing technology in the classroom as it helps to save time and improve learning experience.

A great challenge

Digital materials enhance the process of teaching and learning. However, the use of these material hinder the attainment of teaching and learning objectives when teachers do not have enough knowledge on how to maximize them given the time constraints. Also, they become challenging when learners do not have appropriate gadgets and resources in using these materials.

The participants also experienced the same challenges in using the digital materials.

As Participant 1 professed, “I see digital materials as a great challenge. I consider myself skilled in preparing materials but the difficulty comes in making too many for our discussions.” He also shared that working on digital materials consumes much time and work.

Moreover, Participant 2 said that digital materials may be unnecessary due to the availability of printed materials. Some teachers may prefer the use of printed materials since they are not familiar with the use of digital materials; many are not familiar with the interface and design of Google Classroom.

Participant 5 agreed and added, “it’s very challenging since some of my students do not have appropriate gadgets and stable internet connection. That means we have to provide materials for these students who do not have access online.”

These claims are supported by Sudarsana et al. (2019) who mentioned that education becomes expensive because not all parties can acquire gadgets, and educators find it difficult to adapt to new technology advancements.

Learners’ views of digital materials

As teachers have their own views about digital materials, it cannot be denied that all preparations and learning materials being prepared are for the learners. Thus, aside from ensuring academic success, these materials enhance physical and cognitive skills.

This study also described the learners’ views of digital materials which were identified in the following themes: easier learning materials and newer way to learn concepts.

Easier learning materials

As students become digital natives and frequently exposed to using gadgets and technology, many students prefer the use of digital materials as they find them easy to use.

Participant 6 said, “Digital Materials are much easier to use since I can access and read the materials anytime without carrying around piles of paper.”

Participant 9 agreed and mentioned that she could easily check and click her Google Classroom in order to access the materials.

Participant 8 said that digital materials are easier to access; however, “Sometimes I can’t fully catch up with the lesson due to bad connection.”

In the blog written by Explorance (2022), it was mentioned that traditional textbooks are being partially replaced by search engines and e-books as they just a click away. Moreover, digital materials provide easy-to-access information that makes studying convenient since access to practically everything is a click away and users would not be restricted to a specific area.

Newer way to learn concepts

As online distance learning started when pandemic arose a few years back, more and more online applications and softwares were created and developed. Thus, learning has become more fun and interesting.

Participant 11 said, “I view it as something different and new since going back to Junior High School, we mainly use textbooks in discussing literary stories.”

Participant 15 also said, “I enjoy activities in Google Classroom. For example, the PadLet to review the things learned from the previous lessons in the Connect part of our lesson.”

Participant 10 also liked digital materials since she enjoyed going back to and reviewing lessons posted in Google Classroom.

Sudarsana (2019) mentioned that teachers should avoid monotonous teaching as it reduces students’ interest in learning. Thus, Educational Technology shall be applied in the teaching and learning process as it helps in creating learning-related materials so that students are motivated more to learn. Games can also be incorporated in lessons because they can make students more active and critical in learning activities.

Teachers’ views of printed materials

According to Knight (2015), teachers use textbook since they believe that books are still trustworthy materials as they come from reliable sources and that have undergone rigid processes before being published. Textbooks can serve as a foundation for important, authoritative knowledge for the disciplinary community of practice rather than seeing them as finished work. Textbooks are recognized as "sources of reputable knowledge," and "helpful to organize the basic emphasis of a course," according to specific comments. Also, textbooks are helpful during the evaluation process "since they provide learners with credible information."

This study described the teachers’ views of printed materials which were identified in the following themes: helpful and useful learning materials, and reliable and effective resources.

Helpful and useful learning materials

Nord Anglia Education (2020) mentioned that books are important in everyone's life, especially for young people. Reading books helps pupils learn more, develops their intellect, and raises their awareness of the diverse nations and civilizations around the world. Additionally, reading literary works helps students develop their imagination and creativity.

Participant 4 said “books are more useful because students can view and read them anytime.” She further mentioned that it is helpful when giving activities during class discussions since students rely more on printed materials.

Participant 2 agreed to this and said “they are helpful especially in independent learning since the activities are concise and the basic fundamentals of the lessons are already there.”

Promalayalam (2022) mentioned that it is impossible to overstate the value of books. There would not be any knowledge without books as they are still effective learning tools. They are the perfect media for education, not just for fun. Additionally, they are useful approaches for learning.

Reliable and effective resources

OECD (2021) said that printed materials are considered among the most reliable learning materials since they undergo rigid phases before being published. Also, a study revealed that students perform better when they read from printed materials as opposed to digital ones.

Participant 1 firmly said, “We have been using these materials ever since so I can say they are tested and proven as the most effective.”

In addition, Participant 3 mentioned, “Printed materials are still reliable in terms of production of information.” She even added that the teachers have been using printed materials

Lastly, Participant 4 said, “My students still rely more on printed materials than those posted in Google Classroom when I give activities during class discussions.”

These claims are supported by the study of Knight (2015) that textbooks are credible sources that provide content that supports and enhances students' understanding of key concepts and offer information to solidify student learning.

Learners' views of printed materials

Despite the recent focus on using digital materials, printed materials remain an essential part of classroom instruction, especially for distance learning (Fung, 2007).

Nnamdi-Eruchalu (2012) also added that textbook is a manual that directs the instructor and the student in achieving the subject's objectives.

The following section discusses the learners' views of printed materials which were identified in the following themes: (1) healthier learning materials and (2) accessible to all learners.

Healthier learning materials

According to Manila Standard (2021, Rex Education, a well-known supplier of educational services in the Philippines, advises that primary schoolchildren, ages 6 to 12, limit their daily screen time to no more than 1.5 hours. It should not last longer than two hours a day for secondary schoolchildren between the ages 13 and 17.

Students are more susceptible to screen fatigue as a result of their increased screen time, which can cause eye redness, dryness, and irritation as well as blurred vision.

Participant 10 stated that printed materials are better since she has eyes problems. “I prefer to use modules since I can't study longer using gadgets.”

Participant 11 agreed and said that printed materials are much more efficient and safer for his eyes.

Participant 6 also mentioned that she found printed materials more convenient since she has short attention span and she is easily distracted by the notifications which appears on her gadgets. “I can focus on them for hours since the only thing in front of me are the papers.”

In the study conducted by Tosun (2014), 25.6% of the participants preferred printed materials to protect their eye health. Printed text is easier on the eyes than e- readers; many

students and consumers opt for paper books rather than electronic ones. Moreover, when compared to readers of e-books, readers of print books were found to retain and remember more of the information they read. The ability to take notes and underline key passages in printed books also enables learners to better absorb and comprehend the subject matter.

Accessible to all learners

Reading a printed book gives the reader a more physical experience as books have weathered the test of time. Also, all learners were used to having printed materials as they have been using this kind of material years ago. Lastly, modules being provided in the school are better than providing electronic gadget.

Participant 9 agreed and said, “Printed Materials are much more accessible to all learners because not all of them have gadgets.”

Participant 15 shared that it is difficult to become a 21st Century Learner as it requires being updated with the latest gadgets and technology so she prefers to use printed materials since they are provided by the school. “My parents are minimum wage earners and I don’t want to ask for a new gadget as I understand how difficult our life is.”

Learners who do not have the means of providing themselves the latest gadgets and technology as well as good internet connection can still continue learning with the use of printed materials.

According to Adeoye and Popoola (2011), learners must have access to necessary informational materials and resources for learning to occur. To guarantee certain levels of performance, they must connect with institutions and real and intangible resources.

Sufficiency of digital materials according to teachers

The use of technology permeates every aspect of people’s daily life. According to Harrell (2018), learners nowadays always use their gadgets and connected to Internet; hence, they are called as digital natives.

Moreover, schools are now mandated to incorporate technology into teaching and learning in order to better prepare students for careers and 21st Century skills.

The following section discusses the sufficiency of digital materials from the perspective of Senior High School English teachers. The emergent themes generated were the following: (1) Adaptability to Different Learning Styles and (2) Integration of Softwares and Applications.

Adaptability to different learning styles

In this ever-changing world, education has been constantly changing and improving. Thus, teachers must provide varied activities in order to meet the diverse learners’ need.

Participant 2 mentioned, “Digital materials are enough to cater to students who have different learning styles.” She further shared that literary stories can be understood through visual aids such as YouTube videos posted in Google Classroom.

Participant 4 supported this by saying, “Contents and activities posted in Google Classroom provide appropriate discussions for students who are visual or auditory learners.”

An article written by Buhay (2020) discussed how technology works for every learning style. He pointed out that students learn differently, and while it is a constant challenge for educators to fulfill the needs of various students, the correct technology may reduce stress and produce efficient results in the teaching and learning environment.

Integration of softwares and application

As technology shows rapid advancements and more innovative gadgets are developed, new digital tools enable improvement of learning outcomes. Many web-based activities were developed and were being used by the teachers and learners.

As participant 3 shared, “Classes become enjoyable through the use of E-Learning Games which can be posted in Google Classroom or used during Google Meetings.” However, she highlighted a disadvantage of online applications and softwares since most of them require license or subscription in order to be accessed.

Participant 1 said, “Softwares in Google Classroom make our classes easier. Google Forms, for example, are used during examinations. Giving and checking exams became easier in Google Forms.” But he added that he is not well- trained and taught on digital materials best suited to his subject.

In the study of Korucu (2019), it was shown that classroom use of educational and digital application improves student engagement and enthusiasm for the lecture, are effective in stimulating scientific innovation and problem-solving techniques, and favorably impact academic success.

Sufficiency of digital materials according to learners

Dziuban et al. (2015) mentioned that learners find digital materials satisfactory because they develop their capacities to interact, reflect, comprehend the subject, collaborate, obtain information, inquire, comprehend the needs of the course, and manage their own learning.

The following section discusses the sufficiency of digital materials from the perspective of Senior High School learners. The emergent themes generated were the following: (1) Provide in-depth discussion of literary works and (2) Easy communication.

Provide in-depth discussion of literary works

Learners view Digital Materials as easier learning materials and newer means of learning concepts as they provide in-depth discussion of literary works in 21st Century Literature.

As Participant 7 said “These materials are suitable when learning 21st Century Literature, especially to students like me. They help me to understand issues easily and aid me in discovering additional information about the lesson.”

Participant 9 added, “We learn additional lessons from supplemental materials provided by our teacher.”

Participant 11 also mentioned, “Our teacher provides examples and videos for better understanding. They allow me to have in-depth comprehension of our lessons.

However, Participant 10 said, “Materials in Google Classroom are sufficient but due to internet issues, they become a problem in accessing videos, etc. provided by the teacher.”

According to Schwartz (2020), online learning resources enhance retention and learning. Teachers can show pupils vivid, enticing examples of the topic they try to teach through films, learning games, and photographs. Historical subjects that are dull or challenging to understand can be made lively and engaging; thus, teachers can increase their pupils' interest in the subject and, as a result, their comprehension of it. Overall, they will produce a learning environment that is considerably more effective and interesting.

Easy communication

Aside from being supplemental to concepts they discuss in literature, students find digital materials sufficient since they can easily communicate with the teachers and even their other classmates.

This is attested by Participant 15 who said that aside from materials posted in Google Classroom, they can also easily communicate with their teacher since they are under remote coaching.

Participant 12 also said, “What I like about these digital materials is they can be shared right away through the use of technology.”

Participant 8 appreciated the efforts of his teacher in 21st Century Literature because aside from the use of Google Classroom, his teacher manages to have Facebook Groups and Messenger Group Chat in order to communicate with them and assures that the lessons are accessible and understood.

Faizi et al., (2013) explored the potential advantages of social media in education in their paper. Social media have been found to improve communication and student-to- student and teacher-to-student contact. Teachers and students can now communicate with one another during or in between lessons. Social media have also been found to be successful tools for increasing student involvement since they give shy, scared, or disengaged students a more comfortable environment in which to share ideas and voice out their opinions.

Sufficiency of printed materials according to teachers

According to Oakes and Saunders (2002), textbooks and other educational resources are crucial and necessary for education. They are important and crucial to education at the most evident level because they are the main resources that schools use to give learners access to the knowledge and abilities they are expected to learn.

The following section discusses the sufficiency of printed materials from the perspective of Senior High School teachers. The emergent themes generated were the following: (1) Integration of Connect, Coach and Check (3Cs) and (2) Accessible to All Learners

Integration of connect, coach and check (3Cs)

Connect, Coach, and Check or so-called 3Cs is a way of organizing printed flexible learning modules for PHINMA students. It enables the teacher to connect with the learners by providing initial activities to engage the learners. Then, to coach and discuss major lessons and check and assess if students have attained the specific learning objectives.

Participant 5 said, “Certain topics or information can be easily seen since the modules are more organized this time.”

Participant 3 added that printed materials are enough because they are reproduced before the start of classes.

Moreover, the school makes sure that everybody receives the complete set of modules.

On the other hand, Participant 1 said, “I appreciate the new design of the modules. However, 21st Century Literature requires several reading materials – the contents of which are not enough for me.”

In the article written by Omololu (2021), the syllabus and prescribed curriculum are outlined in textbooks. He makes sure that the subjects are covered uniformly in all schools and states. Since they are organized by themes, textbooks make teaching numerous subjects systematic. Students can better understand the teachings and follow along with them because of this.

Accessible to all learners

Teachers found printed materials sufficient as they are provided and can be accessed by all types of learners.

Participant 4 said, “they are more efficient to use since they give all of my students’ easy ways of learning through the visibility and accessibility of modules.”

Participant 2 also believed that the use of modules is somewhat better since she would not think of students who cannot access online materials for various reasons. “I’m somewhat tired of hearing my students reason out that they were not able to view lessons posted in Google Classroom due to internet issues; so I make sure that most of the materials are provided during face-to-face classes.” However, she highlighted that printed materials are not really enough to simplify and explain literary works in order for the story to be understood better.

In an article published by USAID in 2020, the importance of accessible learning materials such as books improves academic success, vocabulary development, attention, and job attainment.

Sufficiency of printed materials according to learners

Both teachers and learners believed that books are still the most reliable sources of information. The distinctiveness of print materials can be attributed to their efficiency in terms of both time and money.

The following section discusses the sufficiency of printed materials on the perspective of Senior High School learners. The emergent themes generated were the following:

(1) Affordable and Well-provided by the teachers and (2) Designed to have Learner-Centered Activities.

Affordable and well-provided by the teachers

SHS Learners found the printed materials sufficient as their teachers provided them with appropriate resources that would meet their learning needs. Moreover, the learners believed they are affordable since the school has provided them with complete set of modules at the beginning of the class.

Participant 10 said, “Printed materials are sufficient enough since complete activities are provided. Also, complete modules are given before the start of formal classes.”

Participant 7 added that the printed notes provided by his subject teacher in 21st Century Literature are sufficient because they enable us comprehend the lesson by simply reading them. “We don’t need to spend money for the materials given to us by our teachers since they just provide them to us,” he added.

Participant 12 also added, “They are very sufficient since all activities are already provided – even the answer sheets.”

If teachers provide enough and appropriate printed materials and resources to students, learners will better understand the literary works presented to them. According to DFID (2007 in Okongo, 2015), the most cost-effective factor influencing student success is the adequacy of instructional materials, such as textbooks, which serve as the primary source of education. Furthermore, textbooks and other reference resources are essential to efficient teaching and learning; their lack or insufficiency causes teachers to treat subjects abstractly, giving the impression that they are uninteresting.

Designed to have learner-centered activities

Learners believed that the printed materials provided by their teachers are learner-centered. They are allowed to choose activities and assignments that empower their education.

Participant 15 mentioned that she found the printed materials sufficient, “I am happy that our teacher allows us to choose activities for our performance task.” She said that teachers provide different activities to work on and that they have the freedom to choose what to accomplish especially during performance tasks.

Participant 14 agreed and said that their modules are printed well and all the information are complete. “Our modules are written in the second-person point of view.

It’s like the modules are talking to us.” Also, she mentioned that the Connect, Coach and Check (3Cs) organization of the module enables them to become active and independent learners.

According to Timothy (2015), some learners might prefer to only grasp the fundamentals of a concept, while others would like to fully grasp the subject. Additionally, some students may already be familiar with the subject, whereas others do not have an idea about the topic. Thus, learner-centered approach facilitates personalized learning that cater to the learners’ needs.

Usefulness of digital materials according to teachers

As teachers always strive to utilize the learner- centered approach in their classes, technology can aid in their advancement with access to longitudinal data, material, real-time student data, apps, and more.

The following section discusses the usefulness of digital materials from the perspective of Senior High School teachers. The emergent themes generated were the following: (1) promote flexible learning and (2) eco- friendly learning resource.

Promote flexible learning

Digital materials aid printed flexible learning modules to promote self-independent learning. Teachers found them useful as they make their lives easier and can access to digital formative and summative evaluations, as well as data, for real-time feedback.

Participant 3 said, “They are useful if I implement self-directed learning. Digital materials can support learning flexibility because with the help of new media, learners are able to enter the digital world anytime.”

Participant 4 agreed and said that digital materials are very helpful in flexible learning. “They help me disseminate information and lessons automatically because they are ready-made materials.”

Participant 5 also mentioned that she could easily post in her classes through Google Classroom, Messenger or e-mail. Moreover, she found it easy to give and return students’ scores by using Google Forms. “Aside from using Google Classroom to post digital materials, I also found them easy to generate scores in this app as well return them to the students. I can also provide individual comments to their outputs. Feed backing becomes easier.”

In the article published by School of Education Online (2022), digital learning tools used effectively in the classroom can boost student engagement, assist teachers in creating better lesson plans, and promote individualized instruction. Additionally, they aid learners in developing crucial 21st-century abilities.

Eco-friendly learning resource

Aside from providing ease for teachers and individualized instruction for learners, digital materials also help the environment.

Participant 2 said “Digital materials are effective in simplifying and giving summaries of literary works.

Moreover, they save the environment since they are paperless.”

Participant 1 also mentioned that his online discussions are useful since learners could easily look for the topic as digital materials and search bar is just a click away.

In an article published by Child Hope Philippines (2021), it is true that technological equipment is pricey. Long-term, though, they lower costs. For instance, using online modules or e-books will reduce printing costs. Investing in a computer for teachers will also enable them to create tests more quickly and calculate students' grades.

Usefulness of digital materials according to learners

Today’s generation are digital natives as they are already drawn to technology. Learners believed they are motivated to learn the lessons and encourage innovation and problem-solving.

The following section discusses the usefulness of digital materials from the perspective of Senior High School learners. The emergent themes generated were the following: (1) provide excellent learning opportunity and (2) facilitate remote coaching.

Provide excellent learning opportunity

The learners believed that digital materials provided by their teachers allow them to have personalized learning and entertaining activities to do while attending classes in 21st Century Literature.

Participant 9 said that she likes digital materials because their teacher provides various types of activities and games in Google Classroom. On the other hand, she highlighted “However, it’s not quite useful if you don’t have internet access, you cannot open the digital materials.”

Participant 7 added, “Digital resources are helpful to me because they can provide me with excellent learning opportunities. They help me improve because they are engaging and fun in terms of studying.”

Participant 11 also found them useful since she can easily review these materials especially for future examinations. “... I could check anytime as they are posted in my Google Classroom.”

According to Schwartz (2020), technology aids both teachers and learners to have better and meaningful learning experience. It meets all students’ unique needs with more suitable lectures and explanations; moreover, online learning resources enhance retention and learning.

Facilitate remote coaching

As the Philippine education system had needs to respond to COVID 19, schools had to shift to online education. Thus, remote coaching enabled learners to continue studying despite being away from the usual classroom set up.

Participant 14 said, “They are useful because I can view the materials just by using my laptop or phone.”

Participant 13 added “They are useful because sometimes some students are unable to attend their classes. With these materials, they won’t fall behind even when they can’t attend face-to-face classes.”

Participant 10 also shared that they are useful since he can review posted video discussion in the Google Classroom whenever or wherever they can.

According to Arkorful & Abaidoo (2015), they are the same as e-learning since location and timing considerations are made, they are adaptable. Students enjoy the flexibility of selecting the location and time that work best for them. Also, they allow self-pacing that enables students to learn at their own rate, whether slow or fast.

Usefulness of printed materials according to teachers

According to the World Bank (2009), the base for distribution modalities has been print, which is the cornerstone of education. Print is more readily available, more practical, and more uniform than digital data (text) seen on a computer screen. Print is self-sufficient, thus it may be utilized in any environment without the use of any special equipment.

The following section discusses the usefulness of printed materials from the perspective of Senior High School teachers. The emergent themes generated were the following: (1) promote retention and (2) available and comfortable to use.

Promote retention

The study conducted by OECD (2021) confirms that reading from printed rather than digital sources improves student performance as they promote retention and better literacy outcomes.

Participant 1 mentioned that he has using printed materials and he can attest to the fact that these materials are very useful. Moreover, he said that retention of discussion is the reason why they are most useful. “... when students can read the discussion with something they are holding, at their own pace, retention is ensured.”

In addition, Participant 3 mentioned, “Face-to-face classes need more tangible materials for students in order for them to know and remember the lessons.”

Baron (2021) said that printed materials matter, according to a variety of studies comparing print and digital reading. The best way for most children to learn and retain information over time is through print.

Available and comfortable to use

Teachers are always after the welfare of their learners. Thus, they still prefer to use printed materials for their learners as they still find them always available and comfortable to use.

Participant 5 said, “Printed materials are useful since they are very convenient and you can use it anytime, anywhere.”

Participant 2 agreed to this and found printed materials useful because they are accessible and help in simplifying concepts.

Participant 3 also mentioned “... useful in 21st Century Literature since they are readily available, comfortable to use, can be used in any location and can be duplicated with little expense.”

According to Mayembe and Nsabata (2020), printed materials can be used anytime (morning, noon, night) and anywhere (such as at home, in public vehicles, terminals, or other possible places). They are independent of other equipment and simple to use. Lastly, print media packaging is typically portable and lightweight.

Usefulness of printed materials according to learners

In the article written by Veriava (2015), textbooks matter as they are crucial in every child's learning journey. It was found that students who have their own reading textbooks or who only have to share with other students "perform much better" than those who must share textbooks with multiple classmates.

The following section discusses the usefulness of printed materials on the perspective of Senior High School learners. The emergent themes generated were the following:

- (1) promote retention and
- (2) designed for independent learning.

Promote retention

Both teachers and learners believed that printed materials are useful as they promote retention. Learners believed that printed materials help them focus and have better learning.

Participant 6 said, "I have a short attention span and get easily distracted by notifications from other sites.

Unlike studying with printed materials, I can focus on them for hours since the only things that appear in front of me are papers."

Participant 10 mentioned that they are useful during review because she can highlight important concepts and focus more on studying.

Participant 11 said, "Answering activities in the modules helps me to have better retention of the lessons in COR 011."

In the article written by Baron (2021), students claimed that using paper helps them focus, learn, and remember. Students confessed that when reading digitally, they get sidetracked by things like online social media or YouTube, but when reading in paper copy, everything is clearer and more vivid.

Designed for independent learning

Learners appreciated the printed flexible learning modules since they promote active and independent learning, and safe in-person learning.

Participant 9 shared, "Printed materials are useful since we can work on the activities with less supervision by our teachers. As concept notes and examples are provided, we can easily comprehend some lessons."

Participant 15 added that the materials are useful since activities are completely provided. They were organized from connect, coach and check and that they could answer their modules while waiting for the teacher's additional discussion or instruction of a particular lesson.

Participants 8 and 11 also said that the materials enable them to easily study their lessons and work on the activities without worrying about using stable internet connection.

The study of Aboglila (2021) found out that print media are beneficial to students' academic performance and students are encouraged to use print media resources to help them in their academic projects and assignments in order to be creative, original, and unique.

Implications of digital and printed materials to teaching and learning in 21st century literature

Successful student achievement depends on the effectiveness of teaching materials. In other words, the choice of teaching materials affects the instructional components of lesson

planning in the classroom. Whether it is an engaging worksheet or an informative video, a learner is offered fresh opportunities to put newly acquired knowledge and skills into practice. Learning materials, whatever they are, serve one purpose: to provide better learning opportunities to both teachers and learners (Right, 2018).

This study ascertained the teachers' and learners' views of digital and printed materials, as well as how they perceived them to be sufficient and useful. The results of this study imply that both printed and digital materials are needed as learning resources. Thus, these findings suggest the following: (1) Continue the use of digital and printed materials despite going back to the traditional classroom set-up, (2) Provide appropriate trainings and seminars for teachers in order to provide more appropriate and engaging activities in both learning resources, (3) Sustain the provision of sim card and load allowance and availability of free Wi-Fi hotspots in most visited places in the University, (4) Offer license to online applications and softwares which are deemed necessary to improve the use of digital materials, and (5) Team Learning should provide more engaging activities in printed flexible learning modules.

Continue the use of digital and printed materials despite going back to the traditional classroom set up

As the Department of Education mandated the return of 5-day in-person classes in November 2022, it should be taken into consideration that 21st Century Literature is not all about plain reading of literary works. Based on the results of this study, teachers and learners find digital materials useful as supplemental to printed materials in terms of discussing literary works as they find it more comprehensible to have video presentations than just mere reading of stories. Thus, it is suggested that schools should continue the use of digital materials and make them available to Google Classrooms in order for learners to access wherever and whenever they can.

Provide appropriate trainings and seminars for teachers in order to provide more appropriate and engaging activities in both learning resources

In-service Training for Teachers is an educational experience for teachers. It aims to deepen and develop teaching practices. Most common topics are about classroom management, formulation of instruction delivery plans, classroom assessment activities, etc. In this study, teachers find digital materials a great challenge since they have limited knowledge on what activities are suited for specific lessons they have in 21st Century Literature. This result suggests that better trainings or seminars shall be provided for teachers that would focus on differentiated instruction and activities appropriate for 21st Century Literature. Furthermore, they should also be applicable when using both digital and printed materials.

Sustain the provision of sim card and load allowance and availability of free wi-fi hotspots in most visited places in the university

The University provided sim cards with load allowance when classes resumed during the pandemic a few years back. Moreover, a free Wi-Fi hotspot is available, however, in a small range of location. The result of this study found out that teachers and learners find digital materials useful in accessing; however, they have difficulty due to connectivity expenses and internet connection. In view of this, it is suggested that the University continue providing free sim cards with load allowance as they are beneficial to learners who are accessing digital materials posted in the Google Classroom and other platforms – especially when they are at

their homes. Also, in schools, free Wi-Fi hotspot should be available in areas where learners always stay such as the library, classrooms, etc. Restrictions should be imposed like limiting one account or registered number to have access for a few hours to give everyone equal opportunities to make use of the said facility.

Offer license to online applications and softwares which are deemed necessary to improve the use of digital materials

In relation to having better classroom activities in digital platforms, access to good learning applications and softwares is necessary. The study found out that one of the factors that hinders teachers in providing good digital materials is the license or subscription required to access educational resources in the internet. In view of this, it is suggested that the University and the Team Learning provide funds or partnership with educational websites, applications or softwares in order to provide teachers with better and quality learning resources and materials to be given to the learners.

Team learning should provide more engaging activities in printed flexible learning modules

Both teachers and learners commended the organization and content of the modules provided by the University. In the study, it was shown that module helps the learners to focus and promote retention. This implies that the Team Learning of the University should provide more in-depth contents and activities for literary works which are personalized and safe so that students may achieve active and independent learning.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The study concluded that both digital and printed materials play indispensable roles in the teaching and learning of 21st Century Literature. Teachers and learners found digital materials as convenient supplements to printed ones, facilitating access to additional information and flexible learning opportunities. However, the challenges included limited access to appropriate gadgets, internet issues, and a lack of teacher training on digital tools. Printed materials remained a reliable, accessible, and effective resource, particularly for learners without access to digital tools. Both material types were deemed sufficient and useful in promoting retention and independent learning while catering to diverse learning styles. These materials collectively contribute to achieving educational goals in 21st Century Literature.

Based on the aforementioned findings, it is recommended that in order to enhance the effectiveness of digital materials, schools should prioritize improving infrastructure by ensuring reliable internet connectivity and providing appropriate devices for both students and teachers. Additionally, comprehensive training programs should be implemented to equip educators with the skills needed to effectively utilize digital tools and create engaging instructional content. A balanced integration of digital and printed materials is also recommended. By supplementing printed resources with digital content, schools can cater to diverse learning styles and preferences while addressing resource limitations.

Printed materials should be regularly updated and expanded to include comprehensive and student-centered content that aligns with the curriculum of 21st Century Literature. These resources should also be designed to promote independent learning and retention. Teachers, as the primary facilitators of learning, require continuous professional development to stay abreast of advancements in digital education technologies and to enhance their teaching practices.

Sufficiency and usefulness of digital and printed materials: their implications to teaching and learning 21st century literature

Finally, schools should establish robust monitoring and feedback mechanisms to regularly assess the sufficiency and usefulness of instructional materials. Input from both teachers and learners should be actively solicited to refine and improve the resources provided. This holistic approach ensures that both digital and printed materials remain effective tools for achieving educational goals in 21st Century Literature.

REFERENCES

Abogbila, S. (2021). Impact of print media on student's academic performance of Varanasi City, India. *biomedres.us*. Retrieved February 13, 2023, from <https://biomedres.us/fulltexts/BJSTR.MS.ID.005478.php>.

Adeoye, M.O., & Popoola, S.O. (2011). Teaching Effectiveness, Availability, Accessibility, and Use of Library and Information Resources Among Teaching Staff of Schools of Nursing in Osun and Oyo State, Nigeria. Retrieved March 11, 2023, from <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1556&context=libphilprac>.

Al Rawashdeh, A.Z. et al. (2021). Advantages and Disadvantages of Using e-Learning in University Education: Analyzing Students' Perspectives. *The Electronic Journal of e-Learning*, 19(2), pp. 107-117. Retrieved September 23, 2022, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1296879.pdf>.

Arkorful, V., & Abaidoo, N. (2015). The role of e- learning: Advantages and disadvantages of its adoption in higher education. Retrieved March 11, 2023, from https://www.itdl.org/Journal/Jan_15/Jan15.pdf#page=33.

Baron, N. (2021). What works better for retention - printed or digital texts? *GovTech*. Retrieved February 13, 2023, from <https://www.govtech.com/education/higher-ed/what-works-better-for-retention-printed-or-digital-texts>.

Bell, F. (2011). Connectivism: Its Place in Theory- Informed Research and Innovation in Technology- enabled Learning. *The International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning*.

Blanza, K.K.B. (2022). English Teachers' Digital Literacy: Experiences, Challenges, And Opportunities as Bases for Policy Recommendation. University of Iloilo.

Buhay, R. (2020). How education technology works for every learning style. *FE News*. Retrieved February 7, 2023, from <https://www.fenews.co.uk/skills/how-education-technology-works-for-every-learning-style/>.

Bukoye, R.O. (2019). Utilization of instructional materials as tools for effective academic performance of students: Implications for counseling. *MDPI*. Retrieved September 21, 2022, from <https://www.mdpi.com/2504-3900/2/21/1395>.

Digital, printed learning materials complement each other in New normal–rex education. *Manila Standard*. (2001). Retrieved March 11, 2023, from <https://manilastandard.net/pop-life/358711/digital-printed-learning-materials-complement-each-other-in-new-normal-rex-education.html>.

Dziuban, C. et al. (2015). Student Satisfaction with Online Learning: Is It a Psychological Contract? Retrieved February 16, 2023, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1062943.pdf>.

Explorance. (2022). Retrieved March 11, 2023, from [https://explorance.com/blog/7-reasons-students-need-technology-classroom/#:~:text=Technology%20makes%20it%20easier%20for,opn%20online%20courses%20\(MOOCs\)](https://explorance.com/blog/7-reasons-students-need-technology-classroom/#:~:text=Technology%20makes%20it%20easier%20for,opn%20online%20courses%20(MOOCs)).

Faizi, R., El Afia, A., & Chiheb, R. (2013). Exploring the Potential Benefits of Using Social Media in Education. *International Journal of Engineering Pedagogy*. Retrieved February 9, 2023, from <https://online-journals.org/index.php/i-jep/article/view/2836>.

Fung, Y. (2007). Teachers' views on and use of printed materials in a distance learning teacher education course. Retrieved March 11, 2023, from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/02680510500094231?scroll=top&needAccess=true>.

Ghavifekr, S. & Rosdy, W.A.W. (2015). Teaching and learning with technology: Effectiveness of ICT integration in schools. *International Journal of Research in Education and Science (IJRES)*, 1(2), 175-191. Retrieved September 23, 2022, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1105224.pdf>.

- Grenas, N. (2019). Digital Instructional Materials Utilization and its Relationship to Learning Efficacy in Science Six in Malaya Elementary School District of Rosario West. *Ascendens Asia Journal of Multidisciplinary Research Abstracts*. Retrieved September 23, 2022, from <https://ojs.aaresearchindex.com/index.php/AAJMRA/article/view/7787>.
- Harjanto, A.S., & Sumarni, S. (2019). Teachers' experiences on the use of Google Classroom. *English Language and Literature International Conference (ELLiC) Proceedings*. Retrieved February 4, 2023, from <https://jurnal.unimus.ac.id/index.php/ELLIC/article/view/4704#:~:text=Findings%20showed%20that%20teachers%20use,to%20conduct%20their%20virtual%20classroom>.
- Harrell, S. (2018). Factors Affecting Technology Integration in the Classroom. Retrieved March 11, 2023, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1194723.pdf>.
- How important is technology in education?: American University. School of Education Online. (2022). Retrieved February 10, 2023, from <https://soeonline.american.edu/blog/technology-in-education/>.
- Integraf. (2021). Reading printed materials results in better literacy outcomes. Retrieved September 24, 2022, from <https://www.integraf.eu/communications/press-releases/item/307-reading-printed-materials-proven-to-result-in-better-literacy-outcomes>.
- Kiger, M. & Varpio, L. (2020): Thematic analysis of qualitative data: AMEE Guide No. 131, Medical Teacher, DOI: 10.1080/0142159X.2020.1755030. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://ojs.aishe.org/index.php/aishe-j/article/download/335/553/1557>.
- Knight, K.A and Wang, S.(Reviewing Editor) (2015). Teachers' use of textbooks in the digital age, *Cogent Education*, 2:1, DOI: 10.1080/2331186X.2015.101581 2.
- Korucu, A. T. (2019). Digital Applications in Education and Its Effects: A Meta Analysis Study. Retrieved March 11, 2023, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1301270.pdf>.
- Kurt, S. (2018). Tpack: Technological pedagogical content knowledge framework - educational technology. Retrieved November 30, 2020, from Educational Technology website <https://educationaltechnology.net/technological-pedagogical-content-knowledge-tpack-framework/>.
- Kvavik, R.B. (n.d.). Convenience, Communications, and Control: How Students Use Technology. EDUCAUSE.edu. Retrieved February 6, 2023, from <https://www.educause.edu/research-and-publications/books/educating-net-generation/convenience-communications-and-control-how-students-use-technology>.
- Legal Information Institute. (2004). 20 U.S. Code § 1474 - Technology Development, demonstration, and utilization; Media Services; and instructional materials. Legal Information Institute. Retrieved September 20, 2022, from https://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/text/20/1474#e_3.
- Likoko, S., Mutsotso, S., & Nasongo, J. (2013). The Adequacy of Instructional Materials and Physical Facilities and their Effects on Quality of Teacher Preparation in Emerging Private Primary Teacher Training Colleges in Bungoma County, Kenya. Retrieved September 21, 2022, from <https://www.ijsr.net/archive/v2i1/IJSROFF13020103 3.pdf>.
- Maguire, M., & Delahunt, B. (2017). Doing a Thematic Analysis: A Practical, Step-by-Step Guide for Learning and Teaching Scholars. *All Ireland Journal of Higher Education*. 9 (3). Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://ojs.aishe.org/index.php/aishe-j/article/view/335>.
- Mayembe, E., & Nsabata, S. (2020). Print-based Learning Media. *Journal Educational Verkenning*. Retrieved September 24, 2022, from <https://hdpublication.com/index.php/jev/article/view/23>.
- Merriam-Webster. (n.d.). Usefulness. In Merriam- Webster.com dictionary. Retrieved September 20, 2022, from <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/usefulness>.
- Mithans, M., & Grmek, M. (2020). The Use of Textbooks in the Teaching-learning Process. 10.18690/978- 961-286-358-6.10.
- Nnamdi-Eruchalu, G.I. (2012). The role of textbooks in effective teaching and learning of English as a Second Language. Retrieved September 24, 2022, from <https://www.globalacademicgroup.com/journals/nact>

Sufficiency and usefulness of digital and printed materials: their implications to teaching and learning 21st century literature

/THE%20ROLE%20OF%20TEXTBOOKS%20IN%20EFFECTIVE%20TEACHING%20AND%20LEARNING%20OF%20.pdf.

Oakes, J., & Saunders, M. (2003). Access to textbooks, instructional materials, equipment, and technology: Inadequacy and inequality in California's public schools. eScholarship, University of California. Retrieved March 11, 2023, from <https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4ht4z71v>.

Ocay, J. (2017). What is 21st Century literature? Share and Discover Knowledge on SlideShare. Retrieved September 21, 2022, from <https://www.slideshare.net/jahwella/what-is-21st-century-literature>.

OECD (2021). 21st-Century Readers: Developing Literacy Skills in a Digital World, PISA, OECD Publishing, Paris, <https://doi.org/10.1787/a83d84cb-en>.

Okongo, R.B., Ngao, G., Rop, N., & Nyongesa, W.J. (2015). Effect of Availability of Teaching and Learning Resources on the Implementation of Inclusive Education in Pre-School Centers in Nyamira North Sub-County, Nyamira County, Kenya. *Journal of Education and Practice*. Retrieved February 10, 2023, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1086389.pdf>.

Omololu, M. (2021). Why textbooks are important. Rasmed Publications Ltd. Retrieved February 9, 2023, from <https://rasmedpublications.com/why-textbooks-are-important/#:~:text=Benefits%20of%20Using%20Textbooks&text=It%20transmits%20knowledge%2C%20skills%2C%20attitudes,to%20help%20students%20assimilate%20better>.

Palinkas, L.A., Horwitz, S.M., Green, C.A., Wisdom, J. P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2015). Purposeful sampling for qualitative data collection and analysis in mixed method implementation research. *Administration and policy in mental health*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4012002/>.

Paper vs. Digital. Environmental Paper Network. (2021). Retrieved February 10, 2023, from <https://environmentalpaper.org/paper-vs-digital/>.

Promalayalam. (2022). The technology vs books debate. Retrieved February 4, 2023, from <https://www.promalayalam.com/the-technology-vs-books-debate/>.

Rice, M.F., & Ortiz, K.R. (2021). Evaluating digital instructional materials for K-12 online and blended learning - tech trends. SpringerLink. Retrieved September 16, 2022, from <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11528-021-00671-z#:~:text=Examples%20of%20digital%20instructional%20materials,have%20been%20scanned%20and%20uploaded>.

z#:~:text=Examples%20of%20digital%20instructional%20materials,have%20been%20scanned%20and%20uploaded.

Rosenberg, J.M., & Koehler, M.J. (2015). Context and technological pedagogical content knowledge (TPACK): systematic review. *Journal of Research on Technology in Education*, 47(3), 186–210. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15391523.2015.1052663>.

Roth, K. (2020). *Technology in Education: The Ongoing Debate of Access, Adequacy and Equity*. New York: Bank Street College of Education. <https://educate.bankstreet.edu/independent-studies/248>.

Ruggiero, D., & Mong, C.J. (2015). The teacher technology integration experience: Practice and reflection in the classroom. *Journal of Information Technology Education: Research*, 14, 161–178. <http://www.jite.org/documents/Vol14/JITEv14ResearchP161-178Ruggiero0958.pdf>.

Santos, J.M., & Castro, R.D. (2021). Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK) in action: Application of learning in the classroom by pre-service teachers (PST). *Social Sciences & Humanities Open*, 3(1), 100110. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2021.100110>.

Schwartz, M. (2020). Benefits of technology in the classroom: Helping teachers help our children. *IT Solutions for Manufacturing and Supply Chain*. Retrieved February 9, 2023, from <https://www.cns-partners.com/manufacturing-itblog/the-benefits-of-technology-in-the-classroom-how-can-we-help-teachers-and-administrators-help-our-children>.

Shaw, A. (2016). *Cognitive Load Theory: Structuring Learning Materials for Maximum Retention*. Center for Teaching and Learning | Wiley Education Services. Retrieved September 24, 2022, from <https://ctl.wiley.com/cognitive-load-theory-structuring-learning-materials-for-maximum-retention/>.

- Shrivasta, A. (2018). Research in Learning Technology. DOI:1063519
- Siemens, G. (2005). Connectivism: A Theory for the Digital Age. *International Journal of Instructional Technology and Distance Learning*, Vol. 2, No. 1.
- Smith, D.W. (2013). Phenomenology. *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/phenomenology/#WhatPhen>.
- Sudarsana, I.K., et al. (2019). Expectations and challenges of using technology in education. Retrieved February 6, 2023, from <https://iopscience.iop.org/article/10.1088/1742-6596/1175/1/012160>.
- Tassone, B.G. (2017). The relevance of Husserl's phenomenological exploration of interiority to contemporary epistemology. *Nature News*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://www.nature.com/articles/palcomms201766>.
- The Importance of Technology in Education in the Philippines. *ChildHope Philippines*. (2021). Retrieved March 11, 2023, from <https://childhope.org.ph/importance-of-technology-in-philippine-education/>
- The World Bank. (2009). Print. World Bank Institute. Retrieved February 13, 2023, from <http://web.worldbank.org/archive/website01006/WEB/0C280.HTM#:~:text=Easy%20to%20use%20and%20portable.&text=Learners%20can%20take%20printed%20material,limited%20access%20to%20advanced%20technology>.
- Thomas, A., & Edson, A.J. (2019). A framework for teachers' evaluation of digital instructional materials: Integrating mathematics teaching practices with technology use in K-8 classrooms. *Contemporary Issues in Technology and Teacher Education*, 19(3). <https://citejournal.org/volume-19/issue-3-19/mathematics/a-framework-for-teachers-evaluation-of-digital-instructional-materials-integrating-mathematics-teaching-practices-with-technology-use-in-k-8-classrooms>.
- Timothy, A. (2021). Learner-centered approach: Does it really matter in e-learning? *eLearning Industry*. Retrieved February 10, 2023, from <https://elearningindustry.com/learner-centered-approach-elearning>.
- Tosh, K., Doan, S., Woo, A., & Henry, D. (2020). What Digital Materials do teachers use? RAND Corporation. Retrieved September 21, 2022, from https://www.rand.org/pubs/research_reports/RR2575_z17.html.
- Tosun, N. (2014). A Study on Reading Printed Books or E-Books: Reasons for Student-Teachers Preferences. Retrieved March 11, 2023, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1018172.pdf>.
- Tuimur, H. N., & Chemwei, B. (2015). Availability and Use of Instructional Materials in The Teaching of Conflict and Conflict Resolution in Primary Schools in Nandi North District, Kenya. Retrieved September 21, 2022, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED560670.pdf>.
- Turayeva, X.T., & Kholmurodova, M.A. (2022). Advantages and disadvantages of digital technologies in language teaching. *Eurasian Journal of Learning and Academic Teaching*. Retrieved September 24, 2022, from <https://geniusjournals.org/index.php/ejlat/article/view/561>.
- USAID. (2020). The importance of accessible learning materials. *Education Links*. Retrieved March 11, 2023, from <https://www.edu-links.org/learning/importance-accessible-learning-materials>.
- Valtonen, T., Leppänen, U., Hyypiä, M., Sointu, E., Smits, A., & Tondeur, J. (2020). Fresh perspectives on TPACK: Pre-service teachers' own appraisal of their challenging and confident TPACK areas. *Education and Information Technologies*, 25, 2823–2842. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-019-10092-4>.
- Valtonen, T., Sointu, E., Kukkonen, J., Kontkanen, S., Lambert, M.C., & Mäkitalo-Siegl, K. (2017). TPACK updated to measure pre-service teachers' twenty-first century skills. *Australasian Journal of Educational Technology*, 33(3). <https://doi.org/10.14742/ajet.3518>.
- Voogt, J., & McKenney, S. (2016). TPACK in teacher education: Are we preparing teachers of use technology for early literacy? *Technology, Pedagogy and Education*, 26(1), 69–83. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1475939x.2016.1174730>.

Sufficiency and usefulness of digital and printed materials: their implications to teaching and learning 21st century literature

Veriava, F. (2022). Why textbooks are a crucial part of every child's learning journey. *The Conversation*. Retrieved February 16, 2023, from <https://theconversation.com/why-textbooks-are-a-crucialpart-of-every-childs-learning-journey-50252>.

Versatech International. (2021). Why print is fundamental to effective education. *Managed Print Services*. Retrieved September 21, 2022, from <https://mps-philippines.com/print-is-fundamental-to-effective-education/>.

Walters, H. (2022). The top 10 benefits of Digital Learning. *eLearning Industry*. Retrieved September 21, 2022, from <https://elearningindustry.com/the-top-benefits-of-digital-learning>.

West, A., Swanson, J., & Lipscomb, L. (2017). Ch. 11scaffolding. *Pressbooks.Pub; Pressbooks*. <https://granite.pressbooks.pub/teachingdiverselearners/chapter/scaffolding-2/>.